

Instructions for Paper Review and Presentation

1 Select an Appropriate Research Paper

- Submit your chosen paper at least 10 calendar days before your presentation. This is mandatory - without timely submission, you won't be allowed to present.
- Choose a scientific article from high-quality academic journals. Use the Web of Science Master Journal List Clarivate to verify the journal's ranking. Look for journals ranked in Q1 (top 25%) or Q2 (top 25-50%) categories. To check a journal:
 - Visit Clarivate - Potential problem: The problem to log in might be that you log in using your CUNI credentials in the first step. When logging in, you should choose the option institutional log in (placed on the right) and select Czech edu system (or something like that). You will be redirected to CAS and must log in via our uni system. After that, you should have access to the Web of Science.
 - Use the search function to find your journal of interest
 - Check its quartile ranking (Q1 or Q2)
 - Download or screenshot the journal's ranking as evidence for your submission
- Examples of suitable journals include (not an exclusive list): Journal of Environmental Economics & Management (JEEM), Review of Environmental Economics & Policy (REEP), Environmental & Resource Economics (ERE), Journal of the Association of Environmental and Resource Economists (JAERE), Economic Systems Research (ESR), Energy Economics (ENECON), Energy Journal (EJ), Energy Policy (EPOL), J Benefit-Cost Analysis, Resource & Energy Econ, Ecological Economics (ECOLECON), J Health Economics (JHE), American J Agri Econ, Food Policy, Agri Econ, Transportation Research Part B, American Economic Review, Journal of Economic Perspectives, Economic Journal
- The difficulty level of your chosen paper will affect your grade (Points A, ranging 1-10). Generally, papers with more complex analysis receive higher points.

2 Understanding Your Paper

- Read the paper thoroughly and prepare to evaluate it by asking yourself:
 - What is the main research question?
 - Why is this research important?
 - How did the authors conduct their research?

- What are the main findings?
- What are the strengths and limitations of this research?
- Take notes on anything unclear or questionable in the paper.

3 Presentation Guidelines

Group Contribution:

- At the start, clearly state how work was divided among group members (in percentages). For example:
 - Equal split: 25% each for a group of 4
 - Different splits: Member 1 (40%), Member 2 (30%), etc.
- If you used AI tools (like ChatGPT), specify:
 - Which tool you used
 - For what purpose (e.g., “Used ChatGPT to help simplify complex economic terms”)
 - How you verified the information

Presentation Structure (40-45 minutes):

- Introduction (3 minutes):
 - Paper title, authors, journal
 - Why this paper matters
- Main Content (5-10 minutes):
 - Research question
 - How the authors studied the problem
 - What data they used
 - Main findings
- Critical Analysis (15 minutes):
 - Detailed evaluation of methodology
 - Assessment of theoretical framework
 - Analysis of empirical strategy
 - Discussion of results’ validity
 - Potential limitations and their implications
 - Suggestions for improvement
 - Alternative approaches that could have been used
- Q&A Discussion (15 minutes)

Technical Requirements:

- Prepare at maximum 25 slides; plan for approximately 1-2 minutes per slide
- Use PowerPoint or LaTeX; include visual elements (graphs, tables) when relevant; use font size 24+ for main text; and include slide numbers
- Dedicate more slides to critical analysis (approximately 8-10 slides)
- You may choose a group member who will start to present or take over the full presentation. However, all group members must be ready to present any part of the presentation; Teachers may interrupt you and ask another group member to continue at any time.
- If you present longer than 30 minutes, all group members will be penalised.

Teachers will evaluate your presentation quality (Points B, ranging 1-10)

4 Class Participation

- Actively participate in discussions of other groups' presentations by:
 - Asking meaningful questions
 - Providing constructive feedback
 - Sharing relevant insights
- You can earn up to 20 points (Points C) for quality participation

5 Final Grade Calculation

Your individual grade will be calculated as:

$$\text{grade} = \min\{((A \times B) + C) \times \text{your_contribution_share}; 30\}$$

where:

A = Paper difficulty score (1-10)

B = Presentation quality score (1-10)

C = Participation points (0-20)

$\text{your_contribution_share}$ = Your percentage of group work (0%,...,100%)

Example:

If your paper receives $A = 8$, $B = 7$, and $C = 14$, and your contribution share is 25% (0.25):

Your grade is: $\min\{((8 \times 7) + 14) \times 0.25; 30\} = \min\{17.5; 30\} = 17.5$

Note: The formula will be adjusted for groups with fewer or more than 4 members to ensure everyone has a chance to earn up to 30 points.

This instruction was edited and formatted by using the AI Claude-3.5-Sonnet-200k.

Good luck!