

e2 ἐπ' ἔσχατον τὸν ἀέρα: cf. c4-5 ἐν μέσῳ τῷ πυθμένι. **e3** κατιδεῖν <ᾶν> ἀνακύψαντα: the acc. + inf. construction penetrates here into a causal clause (e2 ἐπεὶ ...). The addition of ᾶν (not found in any of the MSS) is necessary to supply the required apodosis of a future remote condition ('if someone were to ... , he *would* stick up his head and see'). Part of the apodosis is given here; then follows a comparison (e4-5 ὥσπερ ... τὰ ἐνθάδε), after which the apodosis appears in a fuller form (e5 οὕτως ... κατιδεῖν). For the image, cf. *Phdr.* 248aff., where the charioteer of the most godlike of non-divine souls flies up and manages to stick his head through the outermost rim of the universe, so glimpsing the true reality beyond (249c3-4 ἀνακύψασα (ἡ ψυχὴ) εἰς τὸ δὴ ὄντως, represented in this context by the forms); and the simile of the prisoners in the cave at *Rep.* 514a-517a, in which one of them finds himself freed and dragged up into the true light of the sun. Here in the *Phaedo*, as in the other two cases, there is reference to the difficulty of the process (e6): what S. is urging is a complete change of perspective. **e6** εἰ ἡ φύσις ἱκανὴ εἴη ἀνασχέσθαι θεωροῦσα 'if his nature were capable of holding up under the sight of them': in the first place he would, of course, be out of his element, like fish out of water; but there is also the suggestion that the sight itself would be overpowering (see preceding n.).

110a1 ἥδε μὲν γὰρ κτλ.: the acc. + inf. construction is finally abandoned, after the ὅτι-clause beginning in 109e7. **a5** πηλός 'mud': listed at *Parm.* 130c6 among the least valuable of things. **a6** βόρβοροι: βόρβορος, unlike πηλός (which can also mean 'potter's clay'), has entirely negative connotations (cf. 69c6). The plural, perhaps used partly for variation, may indicate different quantities/areas (or types?) of slime. **δπου ἂν καὶ ἡ γῆ ᾔ** 'wherever the earth also is', the implication being that in the sea even the earth itself is rendered imperfect. **a7** πρὸς τὰ παρ' ἡμῖν κτλ. 'in no way at all worthy of being judged in relation to the beauties in our world'. **a8** ἐκεῖνα δὲ αὖ 'But those things in their turn', i.e. the things on the surface of the 'true' earth.

b1 εἰ γὰρ δὴ καὶ μῦθον λέγειν καλόν 'for if [it is] right also to tell a story' (the alternative reading εἰ γὰρ δεῖ καὶ μῦθον λέγειν comes to much the same thing). The ᾶν ... φανεῖν of a8 has already marked the new subject (ἐκεῖνα) as one that S. is less sure about than the things he has been saying, about which he is 'convinced'; describing it, he now

admits, will be a matter of story-telling. The new part of his account in fact seems like a continuation of the preceding one, and hardly distinguishable from it in kind. The underlying message of both parts is that we have a false perception of the significance of our existence here 'on' the earth, which is certainly something of which the whole conversation proves S. to be in no doubt: if it is all a 'story', nevertheless it will contain truths (cf. 114d, with 70b6n., 61e1-2n., 61b5n., and Introduction §7). γὰρ δὴ: cf. 76a1n. **b2** οἷα τυγχάνει κτλ. 'what the things on the earth under the heaven actually are like' (i.e. the things that are on the real surface of the earth, under the real heaven). **b3** ἀλλὰ μὴν: cf. 58d7n. (also for the γε). **b5** λέγεται: S. disowns responsibility even for his μῦθος; but by now the fiction that he is drawing on some unnamed source (see 108c8n.) is visibly wearing thin. **b6** ἡ γῆ αὕτη 'this earth', i.e. the one mentioned at b2, the real one. **b6-7** ὥσπερ αἱ δωδεκάσχυτοι σφαῖραι: as ancient as well as more modern craftsmen had evidently discovered, twelve pentagons of leather sewn together to form a dodecahedron will give the closest approximation to a sphere which can be constructed from flat surfaces. The dodecahedron is also, in mathematics, one of the five regular solids: at *Tim.* 55c, the Divine Craftsman, who is also a divine mathematician, having used up the other four in constructing the molecules of fire, air, water and earth, uses the dodecahedron for the construction of 'the whole', i.e. the cosmos itself. In the present context, however, as the rest of the sentence shows, the leading idea is not so much the shape of the earth – which has already been said to be spherical – as its appearance as a variegated (ποικίλη, b7) patchwork. Cf. Loriaux. **b7** χρώμασιν διελιμμένη 'picked out in different colours'. **b8** εἶναι: sc. λέγεται. ὥσπερ δείγματα 'like samples'. In this instance, as it will turn out to be the case in others, our world contains traces of the beauties to be found in the world above, just as it (in some sense: see 100d4-6n.) contains 'traces' of the forms, which can remind us of them. But it is, after all, a part of 'Hades' which S. is describing, which is where, if anywhere (according to his 'defence'), the philosopher will expect to achieve the knowledge for which he has striven during life. (The idea of 'our' colours as δείγματα of the real ones suggests a relationship based on likeness: see 100a1-3n. But it would be unwise to suppose that the present context – which is now, after all, explicitly one of story-telling – can really give us any further useful information

about the form-particular hypothesis, much though we might wish for it.)

c1 ἐκ τοιούτων: i.e. out of such colours. **c2-3** τὴν μὲν . . . τὴν δὲ . . . , τὴν δὲ . . . 'part of it . . . another part . . . , another . . .'. **c3** ἀλουργῇ . . . καὶ θαυμαστὴν τὸ κάλλος 'purple and wonderful in its beauty', i.e. of a wonderfully beautiful purple. **c4** τὴν δὲ . . . λευκοτέραν 'another part, as much of it [sc. the earth] as is white, whiter than chalk or snow'. **c6** καὶ γὰρ . . . **d3** φαντάζεσθαι 'These very hollows in it, full to the brim as they are of water and air, offer an appearance (εἶδος, 'visible aspect': cf. ἰδέα at 108d9) of colour as they glitter among the variegated colours around them, so that its appearance is of one continuous variegated surface' (lit. 'so that one continuous variegated appearance of it is presented to the eye': εἶδος again). The idea of continuity is mimicked by the simple juxtaposition of the two adjectives (συνεχὲς ποικίλον) in the last part of the sentence, describing the whole, and the repetition of words and ideas from the first part, describing the hollows (αὐτῆς . . . τι εἶδος . . . ποικιλίαι / τι αὐτῆς εἶδος . . . ποικίλον). Two things seem to be implied: (a) that the hollows, like the one in which we live, have no colour of their own, only reflecting the real colours around them; but (b) that this leaves the beauty of the upper surface itself undiminished.

d3 τοιαύτη: i.e. so different from (and especially so much more beautiful than) our earth. **d5** καὶ αὖ τὰ ὄρη ὡσαύτως 'and similarly, in their turn, with the mountains': i.e., as is explained in καὶ τοὺς λίθους κτλ., they too show the same proportionate difference. **d7** ὧν καὶ 'and it is of these, in fact' (cf. *GP* 294-5).

e1 ἐκεῖ δὲ . . . **2** καλλίω 'but there [there is] nothing [sc. of the relevant type: rocks or stones] which is not of this sort, and still more beautiful than these'. **e2** τὸ δ' αἴτιον . . . **6** παρέχει: according to Sedley 1989-90, 371, there are two levels of explanation in this context, a materialistic one (represented by e2-6), and a deeper, teleological one, by which the difference between the higher realm and ours is for the sake of the greater happiness of those above (see esp. 111a2-3). But it would be simpler to read e2-6 as an application of the general principle that everything in the upper world is perfect, as it is not with us (something which Sedley's teleological αἴτιον seems not to explain). **e4** ὥσπερ

. . . **5** συνερρηκόντων 'as those here [have been corrupted and eaten up] by mildew and brine because of the things that have settled together here' (i.e. water, mist, and air: 109b6-7). **e5** καὶ γῆ: cf. a6n. **e5-6** τοῖς ἄλλοις ζώοις τε καὶ φυτοῖς 'and to animals and plants besides'. **e6** αἰσχῇ 'uglinesses', i.e. forms of ugliness.

111a2 πανταχοῦ τῆς γῆς 'everywhere on the earth'. **a2** ὥστε . . . **3** θεατῶν: lit. 'so that to see it is a spectacle that belongs to fortunate spectators'. Cf. Hom. *Od.* 5.73-4 ἐνθα κ' ἔπειτα καὶ ἀθανάτος περ ἐπελθὼν | θηήσαιτο ἰδὼν καὶ τερφεῖη φρεσὶν ἥισιν: of Calypso's cave and its surroundings, one of the many poetic descriptions of earthly paradises which are recalled by S.'s account. 'Belongs to fortunate spectators' – fortunate, of course, because of the beauty of the things seen, not because of their potential exchange value, in which those who live there will have no, or little, interest: the population consists of, or includes (see following n.) those of us who are judged previously to have lived exceptionally good lives (114b6-c2, though without having attained full 'purification' through philosophy, c2-5), which according to the implications of S.'s 'defence' (see 68c8-12, 68e2-69c3, 66c2-d3) is incompatible with any but the most moderate concern with material things. **a4** ἀνθρώπους: i.e., presumably, combinations of soul and something which is at least comparable to our bodies, though its needs (a7-b1) and capacities (b2-6) are different. It seems to be only the perfectly purified philosophers who will have a wholly incorporeal existence (114c3-4 ἄνευ . . . σωμάτων ζῶσι τὸ παράπαν); cf. the account of the fate of unpurified souls at 81b-e. Since other things, including plants and animals, are apparently permanent features of the upper world, it is natural to suppose the same to be true of the human beings referred to here, i.e. that they are a quite distinct race from us, who will be joined by some of the more fortunate of us from time to time; on the other hand, it may be more economical to identify the two groups with one another (if it is a separate race which lives on the 'real' earth, should we not need a separate eschatology for them?), and the phrasing of 114b6-c2 is certainly in favour of it ('those who seem to have lived exceptionally well are the ones who . . .'). But we should be careful not to press S.'s 'story' too hard. The emphasis of the present context is on the superior quality of existence in the world above, and so on the inferiority of our own. The theme of

the destinations of souls after death will be reintroduced only later. **a6–7** ἄς περιρρεῖν τὸν ἄερα πρὸς τῇ ἡπείρῳ οὐσας ‘around which the air flows, being close to the mainland’. As Burnet says, this is P.’s way of making room in his landscape for the Isles of the Blest (the traditional alternative destination to Hades for human beings above the common run): (νῆσοις) ἄς ... ἄερα is a neat, playful variation of Pindar’s lines ἐνθα μακάρων | νᾶσον ὠκεανίδες | αὔραι περιπνέουσιν (*Ol.* 2.70–2). Burnet’s explanation of S.’s stipulation of the nearness of the islands to the ‘mainland’ is probably also right – if they were further out, we should see them as we look up. **a7** ἐνὶ λόγῳ ... **b1** τὸν αἰθέρα ‘in a word, what water and the sea are to us in relation to our needs, that air is there, and what air is to us, aether is to them’. ‘In a word’, because S. is both generalising – air there plays the role not just of the sea here, but of water as a whole (for this sort of use of τε ... καί, see *GP* 515) – and, in part, recapitulating, by reintroducing the subject of aether from 109b4–c3. ‘In relation to our needs’: presumably, then, the inhabitants of the upper world will ‘fish’ for birds, ‘drink’ air, and ‘breathe’ aether: just as in Hom., ichor, not blood, runs in the veins of the gods? S. continues in the light tone clearly identifiable in a6–7.

b1 τὰς δὲ ὥρας ... **2** τοιαύτην ‘Their climate is such’ (lit. ‘the seasons for them have / are constituted by such a mix’, sc. of hot, cold, dry, wet). **b3** χρόνον ... ζῆν πολὺ πλείω: if the inhabitants of the upper world do come from here, i.e. from our world (see a4n.), then their life would be equivalent to our death, and their ‘dying’ would be a matter of their returning here (see 107e2–4), and – as we call it – being born (again, into a new body). Cf. 107c3 ἐν ᾧ καλοῦμεν τὸ ζῆν. **b3** καὶ ὀφει ... **6** πρὸς καθαρότητα: if their sensory faculties (πᾶσι τοῖς τοιοῦτοις = the other senses, apart from sight and hearing?) are superior to ours, because of the greater purity of the medium (aether as opposed to air, the difference being measured by that between water and air), then the point S. made in his defence about the obstruction caused by the senses to the acquisition of φρόνησις (65a9–b6) will be less applicable; indeed now – as he implies, by blandly listing φρόνησις along with them – the senses will even be an aid to its acquisition, since things are seen as they really are (c1–2). **b6** καὶ δὴ καὶ ‘Moreover’ (further evidence of the superiority of their existence). **b7** ἐν οἷς τῷ ὄντι οἰκητὰς θεοὺς εἶναι: this is perhaps one step short of the

relationship with the gods referred to at 69c7 (‘living with the gods’) and 82b10 (‘joining the race of the gods’), but consistent with what S. expects for himself at 63b5–c3 (‘entering the presence of gods who are good and wise masters’). **b7–8** καὶ φήμας τε καὶ μαντείας καὶ αἰσθήσεις τῶν θεῶν: sc. αὐτοῖς εἶναι. Lit. ‘and [they have] utterances and prophecies and perceptions of the gods’, i.e. utterances and prophecies from them, perceptions of them – all direct, as the preceding relative clause implies, and as is confirmed by what follows (καὶ τοιαύτας κτλ.).

c1 αὐτοῖς πρὸς αὐτούς: i.e. face to face. καὶ ... γει: ‘what is more’ (as at 58d1, etc.). **c2–3** καὶ τὴν ἄλλην κτλ. ‘and their happiness in everything else is in accordance with these things’, i.e. the ones last mentioned: knowledge, and proximity to the divine, are the things that S. thinks most desirable. **c4–5** τὰ περὶ τὴν γῆν ‘the things around the earth’, i.e. the things on its surface. **c5** τόπους δ’ ... **d2** πλατυτέρους ‘but there are places within it, in (κατά: see LSJ s.v. B.1.2) its hollows, many of them in a circle around the whole, some of them deeper and more widely spread out [i.e. with a broader opening] than the one in which we live, while others are deeper but have an opening smaller than ours has, and others (ἔστι δ’ οὗς = τοὺς δέ) are shallower than ours and broader’. The interpretation of this passage, and especially the exact relation of the new ‘places’ to the hollows, is much disputed. But if we read back from what follows, we seem to discover that the places in question are (a) the locations of lakes and seas (112c6–7, 113a6–8), (b) the places from which or into which various rivers, etc. appear or disappear (e1–2, 112c8–d1, e4–113c8), and (c) other χάσματα, in the sense of ‘chasms’ or ‘gulfs’ (see e6–112a1, which introduces the χάσμα of Tartarus, by contrast with χάσμα here in c8 in the sense of ‘opening’). (a), and the openings of (b) and (c), will probably as a rule be located within inhabited hollows like ours, but they may also be on the ‘real’ surface of the earth, as the two openings of Tartarus probably are (and it is doubtful whether there could be life around the lake of Pyriphlegethon, 113a6–8). In the latter case the ‘places’ in question can still reasonably be said to be κατά τὰ ἔγκοιλα τῆς γῆς, from the perspective of someone standing on the surface. Type (c), we may suppose, will be represented by those said to be deeper and wider than ours (c6–7), type (b) by those which are deeper and

narrower (c7-d1), while those which are less deep and broader (d1-2) will be included in type (a). The main purpose of c4-d2, however, is to switch our attention from the things *περὶ τὴν γῆν* to those within it (*ἐν αὐτῇ*), while also indicating, in relation to these too, the insignificance of our region. (*αὐτοὺς* in c8 is strictly redundant, but may ease the change of construction back to acc. + inf.)

d2 *τούτους δὲ πάντας ... 4 ἔχειν* 'All these are connected to each other by numerous subterranean passages, both broader and narrower ones, and have ways through between them.' **d5** *καὶ ἀενάων ... 7 καὶ ψυχρῶν* 'and ever-flowing subterranean rivers, both of hot waters and of cold, of unimaginable size': explaining and expanding *πολὺ ... ὕδωρ*. **d8** *βορβορωδεστέρου*: cf. 110a6n.

e1-2 *ὥσπερ ἐν Σικελίαι κτλ.*: here, as with the references to hot waters and to a 'purer' type of mud (the latter, like the former, associated with volcanic springs?), P. anchors his detailed account of the underworld to known features of our world (there really are rivers of mud and of fire down there, just as we find them at Etna), while simultaneously suggesting 'explanations' of these features (for the tone cf. 112a7-b2n.). (See further 112b6-7n.) But in what follows his sources will more often be poetic and mythical. **e2** *ὦν δὴ καί*: tr. 'it is with these things' (i.e. water, fire, mud). **e3** *ὥς ... γιγνομένη* 'as the circling stream happens to reach each one on each occasion' (Gallop). **e4-5** *ὥσπερ αἰώραν τινά* 'as it were [the movement of] a kind of swing' (cf. *Laws* 789d3, and *αἰωρεῖσθαι* at 98d2), i.e. an oscillation (*αἰώραν* is subject). **e5** *ἔστι δὲ ἄρα ...*: *ἄρα* seems to mark an important new turn in the description (cf. *GP* 32-3, on *ἄρα* as 'expressing a lively feeling of interest'); at the same time S. finally abandons the acc. + inf. construction, even though what follows is doubtless still part of the *μῦθος*, and of what *λέγεται* (110b5). See further 112a7-b2n. **e5-6** *διὰ φύσιν τοιάνδε τινά* 'because of some sort of thing of the following kind'. For *φύσις* in the sense of 'sort', 'class', like *εἶδος*, see LSJ s.v. vi. But the choice of this word here may have a special significance. The explanation S. goes on to give is of a purely mechanistic kind - that is, of the kind offered by experts in 'that wisdom they call *περὶ φύσεως ἱστορίαν*', which he introduced at 96a and then went on to criticise (cf. 108e4-109a6n., 110e2-6n.). Is he perhaps now warning us, through a play on the term *φύσις*, that he is himself about

to behave like the natural philosophers? See further 112a7-b2n., and 113d1 *τούτων δ' οὕτως πεφυκότων* (summarising the 'physical' account of the underworld). The phrase *διὰ φύσιν τοιάνδε τινά* in any case does not suggest any great confidence in the explanation to be offered. **e6** *χασμάτων*: cf. c5-d2n. **e6** *ἄλλως τε ... 112a2 γῆς*: lit. 'is actually largest both in other respects and in being bored right through the whole earth', i.e. it is not only the broadest but also the deepest, in that it is the only one which stretches from one side to the other. ('Right through the earth' might just mean 'right through to the centre', but this hardly seems the most obvious interpretation.) The openings of this *χάσμα* to the surface seem to play no role in the account, except to allow it to fit into the system of *ἔγκοιλα/κοῖλα*. It would fit nicely if it followed the line of axis of the earth (cf. *Rep.* 616b, and *Tim.* 40b, which at least according to Arist. (*DC* 293b30-2) talks of the earth's revolving); but there is no indication of this in the text.

112a3 = Hom. *Il.* 8.14. (*βέρεθρον/βάραθρον*, 'pit', suggests a *τόπος* which is open at least at one end: see preceding n.) **a4** *ἄλλοθι ... ἄλλοι*: *Il.* 8.451; e.g. Hes. *Th.* 119. **a5** *γάρ* seems to introduce the main part of the explanation promised in 111e5-6. **a6** *γίγνονται ... 7 ῥέωσιν*: cf. Arist. *Meteor.* 356a12-14 (commenting on the present passage) *τοὺς δὲ χυμοὺς καὶ τὰς χροίας ἴσχειν τὸ ὕδωρ δι' οἷας ἂν τύχωσι ῥέοντα γῆς* (so e.g. the water may be either salt or fresh: cf. c7-8; for colour, see 113b8-c1). But there are also *ποταμοί* of fire and mud (111d7-8), and the same account is probably meant to be given of them: rivers of mud will flow through muddy regions, rivers of fire through fiery regions. The latter, however, are evidently not pure fire: both 111d-e and 113a-b associate them with lava-flows, and with mud; the second context also directly with water (111d7-e2; 113b5-6, a5-b1). Thus all rivers are still ultimately of water, and can be derived from waters of Tartarus: while at b2 these are referred to more vaguely as *τὸ ὑγρὸν τοῦτο*, 'this liquid' (perhaps because the rivers flowing *in* as well as out will have different characteristics), at c2 they become simply *τὸ ὕδωρ*. **a7 ἢ δὲ ... b2 τὸ ὑγρὸν τοῦτο** 'And the reason why the rivers flow out from there and flow in is that this liquid does not have a bottom or place to stand.' In fact, the full statement of the *αἰτία* extends considerably beyond this sentence: so, S. continues (i.e.

because it has no place where it could come to rest), 'it oscillates and surges to and fro / up and down' (b3; cf. c2-3n.), and as it comes to certain channels, fills these, from which it travels up to regions like ours, and then drains back down again (c1-e3). The obvious objections to this theory are made, after what is by and large (see preceding n.) a fair summary of it, in Arist. *Meteor.* 356a14-33 (e.g. Arist. says 'we shall get the proverbial rivers flowing upwards' - a traditional way of referring to the impossible: Eur. *Med.* 410). But we should remember again that the whole context is one of a μῦθος (110b1), and that S. himself will raise the question about how much of his story is to be believed (114d). The same point may help to weaken the obvious objection that S. now seems to be offering us an 'explanation' which is indistinguishable from the sorts of αἰτίαι - or αἰτία: if we compare αἰτία here at 112b1 with αἴτιον at 110e2, they appear (? *pace* Frede 1980) to be synonymous terms - which he earlier criticised the natural scientists for offering: cf. 111e5-6n. (and 108e4-109a6n., 110e2-6n.). Is he perhaps now parodying them, by producing the same sorts of speculations about the things under the earth as he reported them earlier as producing about the things over it? The parody would be given an additional slant by the fact that S. has suddenly started talking in direct speech: thus we seem to find him, just before his death, doing one of the things that at *Ap.* 19b-c he denies he ever did, but was wrongly accused of doing, ζητῶν τά τε ὑπὸ γῆς καὶ οὐράνια (cf. 26d6-9; for the status of S.'s account of his supposed early interest in science in 96-9, see 95e9n.). But of course we know all along that they are not really S.'s speculations; cf. 111e5-6n. The proper explanation for the movement of liquids within the earth, if S. is at all serious about these, would presumably be teleological: either it has still to be found (see 99c, 108e4-109a6n.), or, as Sedley suggests (1989-90, 369-70), it is connected with the scheme of punishments and rewards for souls outlined in 113d-114c.

b3 δὴ 'So'. **b3-4 καὶ τὸ πνεῦμα:** πνεῦμα is air in motion (cf. *Crat.* 410b): wind, and esp. breath. Both meanings are in play in what follows. **b5-6 εἰς τὸ ἐπ' ἐκεῖνα τῆς γῆς . . . εἰς τὸ ἐπὶ τάδε:** lit. 'towards the [part] of the earth over there . . . towards the [part of the earth] over here' (cf. LSJ s.v. ἐπὶ c.3); i.e. away from us / towards us (which suggests that we are relatively close to one end of Tartarus: cf. Bluck

135). **b6 ὥσπερ τῶν ἀναπνεόντων . . . 7 πνεῦμα:** lit. 'just as the breath of those [creatures] that breathe breathes out and in, flowing'.

c1 εἰσὶν καὶ ἐξίον: i.e. as it moves towards and away from the centre. **δταν τε οὖν:** οὖν is 'resumptive', as at 58b1 etc.; δταν τε is answered by its pair at c4. **c2 τὸν δὴ κάτω καλούμενον:** S. admits the parochialism of the perspective of b5-6; from opposite us, what we call 'down' would appear as 'up'. (*Pace GP* 235, the use of δὴ here seems comparable to its use after relatives, as e.g. at 72a7, 96a8: 'that place which we call "down"'.) **c2 τοῖς κατ' ἐκεῖνα τὰ ρεύματα . . . 3 ὥσπερ οἱ ἐπαντλοῦντες:** lit. 'it flows into the streams in the [places] there through the earth, like those irrigating'; i.e. it flows into the empty channels there, filling them as in the process of irrigation. The simile does important work, referring to the raising of the water (which is what irrigators do): any movement away from the centre will be movement upwards in the absolute sense (as is implied by τὸν δὴ καλούμενον κάτω: see preceding n.). τὰ κατ' ἐκεῖνα is a variation of b5 τὸ ἐπ' ἐκεῖνα (τῆς γῆς), and has the same reference. **c4 δταν τε αὖ ἐκεῖθεν . . . ἀπολίπη:** 'and when in turn its level falls (and it leaves) there', i.e. the hemisphere opposite ours (ἀπολείπειν is regularly used of rivers or streams failing). **c5 τὰ ἐνθάδε:** sc. ρεύματα, those in our hemisphere corresponding to the ones mentioned in c2. **c6 καὶ διὰ τῆς γῆς** is perhaps added to make it clear that S. is still describing things underground. **c7 ὁδοποιεῖται** 'a way is made', maintaining the comparison with the process of irrigation begun in c3 (οἱ ἐπαντλοῦντες; cf. also c6 ὀχετῶν). **c7 θαλάττας . . . 8 ποιεῖ:** cf. Arist. *Meteor.* 351a19ff. ('The same parts of the earth are not always moist or dry, but they change according as rivers come into existence and dry up. And so the relation of land to sea changes too and a place does not always remain land or sea throughout all time . . .') But the reasons Arist. gives are, of course, different from S.'s: cf. a7-b2n.). Some rivers, at least, dry up annually in the Mediterranean. S. does not tell us what time-scale he has in mind, and perhaps we should not ask; to do so would be to imply that he is talking as historian and geographer rather than as story-teller. See further e6-7n.

d1 τὰ μὲν μακροτέρους . . . 2 βραχυτέρους: lit. 'some [streams] travelling round longer and more numerous places, others fewer and shorter': μακροτέρους and βραχυτέρους suggest that τόπους refers to the

channels themselves, as at 111e2 (cf. Robin). It is these 'places' which will turn out to be the main focus of interest, as the locations of the punishments of the dead (113c–114b). S. began at 108c5–6 by saying that εἰσιν . . . πολλοὶ καὶ θαυμαστοὶ τῆς γῆς τόποι; having dealt with those on or near the surface, he then turned to the τόποι ἐν αὐτῇ (111c5), and by stages he is now gradually identifying the important ones. **d3** κατωτέρω ἢ ἐπηγλεῖτο 'further down than [the place at which] it was channelled off'. **d4** πάντα . . . ἐκροῆς: hydraulically speaking, this seems unnecessary (unless it is somehow to prevent a reversal of flow?); it does, however, help to justify the description of any river – seen as a single unit from its exit from Tartarus to its re-entrance there – as flowing *downwards*, a point of some importance in connection with the great rivers of Hades to be introduced in the next section (these are *infernal* rivers, despite the fact that part of their course is upwards). **d5** ἕνια μὲν . . . **6** κατὰ τὸ αὐτὸ μέρος 'some issued from opposite the [part] where they flow in, and some in the same part', i.e. some flow back into Tartarus on the other side of the earth's middle, some on the same side from which they started. **d8** εἰς τὸ δυνατόν κάτω καθέντα πάλιν ἐμβάλλει 'descending as far down as they can' (καθίμι used intransitively), i.e. in their circling; εἰς τὸ δυνατόν is then explained by e1–3 – they can go down as far as the middle, but not beyond it, because the other side, leading away from the middle, will be uphill.

e1 ἐκατέρωσε 'on either side': the reference is to the two sorts of river mentioned in d5–6 (cf. e2 ἀμφοτέροις). **e4** τὰ μὲν οὖν δὴ . . . **5** ἐστι: lit. 'The other rivers, then, are many and large and of all kinds.' μὲν οὖν δὴ is perhaps used like μὲν δὴ, to mark a transition (cf. 64a2n., and GP 258). **e5** δ' ἄραι: see 111e5n. **e6–7** ἐξωτάτω ρέον περὶ κύκλῳ 'flowing furthest out, around in a circle'. The encircling of earth by Oceanus was evidently a popular notion: see Hdt. 4.8, and cf. Hom. *Il.* 18.607–8. But according to *Il.* 21.195–7, it is Oceanus itself 'from which all rivers and all sea and all springs and deep wells flow'. By making Tartarus the source, S. appropriately gives the underworld a more immediate influence on our existence 'here'. In *Od.*, Oceanus seems to form the boundary between the world of the living and that of the dead: see 10.508–12, 11.155–9. **e7** τούτου δὲ καταντικρύ: the reference seems to be to the points of exit of Oceanus and Acheron from Tartarus; but the important point is the opposition between the

two rivers in itself, emphasised by e8 ἐναντίως ῥέων – one being associated with the living, the other with the dead. The third river, Pyriphlegethon, leaves Tartarus midway between Oceanus and Acheron (113a5–6), and Cocytus, the fourth, opposite that: their exits will then be like the four points of the compass somewhere on a horizontal plane across the χάσμα of Tartarus. The other rivers apart from Oceanus all form lakes, all apparently underground (see 113a1–2, a6–8n., c3n.); later in their courses, Cocytus and Pyriplegethon then both approach the lake of Acheron from opposite directions, but do not enter it. All of this is built on *Od.* 10.508–15: 'When you cross Oceanus in your ship, . . . yourself enter the dank house of Hades. There into Acheron flows Pyriphlegethon, and that Cocytus which is a branch (ἀπορρώξ) of the water of Styx; there is a rock and the meeting-place of two roaring rivers.' Plato adds to and varies this picture both for the sake of symmetry, and to meet the demands of his elaborate eschatology: see esp. 113e6–114b6.

113a1 καὶ δὴ καὶ 'and in particular' (cf. 59d7–8n., 85d4). The Acherusian lake is especially ἐρῆμος. ὑπὸ γῆν ῥέων may imply that it previously flowed over the surface (or in a hollow), but need not do so; what it certainly tells us is that the lake is underground. **a2–3** αἱ τῶν τετελευτηκότων ψυχαὶ τῶν πολλῶν 'the souls of most of those who have died': these are the ones who have lived μέσως (d4–e1). **a5** εἰς τὰς τῶν ζώων γενέσεις: this seems to refer back to 81e–82b; if so, ζῶια includes ἄνθρωποι (see 82b6–8n., and cf. 94a8–10). See further d6–e1n. **a6** ἐγγὺς τῆς ἐκβολῆς . . . **7–8** τῆς παρ' ἡμῖν θαλάττης: if the ἐκβολή meant is that from Tartarus (which after the repeated use of ἐμβάλλειν of rivers entering Tartarus, it surely must be: 112d3, 8, 113b4), then this new lake is also underground. This and the other two lakes (the Acherusian, and Styx) seem to form a subterranean analogue of the inhabited hollows above; each is a dwelling-place for a different type of soul (cf. d7 οἰκοῦσι, with d6–e1n.; and 108c2, 5). That the lake of Pyriplegethon is 'bigger than our sea' will then suggest a rather large number of people beating their mothers or fathers (see 114a6); but then the earth is a big place (109a9, etc.)

b1 θολερός 'turbid'; also of mad passion – like the souls of those who will find themselves in it (see preceding n.)? That it is literally fiery does not need to be said, in view of its name, Πυριφλεγέθων. **b1–2**

περιελιττόμενος . . . τῇ γῇ 'winding round in the earth'. **b3** οὐ συμμειγνύμενος τῷ ὕδατι for the idea, cf. *Il.* 2.753-4, where we are told that the water of the Titaessus, being a branch (ἀπορρώξ) of the Styx, will not mix with that of the Peneius. Cf. Hes. *Th.* 777 νόσφιν δὲ θεῶν . . . ναιεῖ, of the goddess Styx; both contexts support the connection of the name with στυγεῖν, 'hate'. **b4** κατωτέρω τοῦ Ταρτάρου 'lower down in Tartarus', i.e. than its ἐκβολή (cf. 112d4). (For the genitive, cf. expressions like **b6** ὅππῃ . . . τῆς γῆς.) **b5-6** οὐ καὶ κτλ.: lit. 'whose lava-streams it is which blast up fragments [of it], wherever on earth they happen to do so', i.e. at various points. **b8-ci** χρῶμα δ' ἔχοντα ὅλον οἶον ὁ κυανός 'and all with a colour such as κυανός [has]': Theophr. (*De lap.* 37) identifies ('male') κυανός as similar to lapis lazuli; in Homer, the adj. κυάνεος indicates a deep blackness, which is what is intended here.

ci ὃν refers to **b7** τόπον. **ci-2** καὶ τὴν λίμνην ποιεῖ ὁ ποταμὸς ἐμβάλλων Στύγα 'and the river creates the lake of Styx, into which it flows'. **c3** δεινὰς δυνάμεις λαβὼν ἐν τῷ ὕδατι 'taking up terrible powers in its water': in Hes. *Th.* 775-806, the δεινὴ Styx is eldest daughter of Oceanus, and her 'famous, cold' water is what the gods swear by (cf. e.g. Hom. *Od.* 5.185-6); if they break their oath, punishment follows. Something so powerful must be terrible magic indeed. **c3** δὺς κατὰ τῆς γῆς might, but need not, imply that the lake of Styx is on the surface (cf. Loriaux 155); if it were, how would the Stygian gloom be explained? **c6** οὐδενὶ μείγνυται: cf. **b3n**. **c8** ὡς οἱ ποιηταὶ λέγουσιν: cf. 112e7n. (κωκυτός = 'wailing'.)

d1 τούτων δὲ οὕτως πεφυκόντων: cf. 111e5-6n. **d2** εἰς τὸν τόπον . . . κομίζει: cf. 107d5-e2, where the place is similarly left unspecified. **d3** διεδικάσαντο: gnomic aor. ('submit themselves to judgement'). **d4** οἱ μὲν ἂν δόξωσι μέσως βεβιωκέναι: i.e. the majority (**a1-3**). **d4** πορευθέντες . . . **5-6** ὁχήματά ἐστιν: the dead had traditionally to be ferried over the rivers of the underworld (see e.g. Aesch. *Sept.* 842, Ar. *Frogs*). But cf. also the metaphor of λόγοι as rafts (ὁχήματα) at 85c-d: the non-philosophical majority mount those ὁχήματα which are available to them; how much better if they had relied on ones of a different sort. **d6** ἐκεῖ . . . **ei** ἕκαστος: lit. 'there they both (τε¹) dwell and in the process of their purification they both (τε²) are absolved of their crimes by paying penalties for them, if any of them has committed any

crime, and (τε³) secure honours for their good deeds, each according to his desert'. Taken strictly, this suggests (a) that their existence in Hades is itself a kind of 'purification', with penalties for crimes being extra; probably (b) that not every soul that finds itself here will have committed crimes (they may just not have distinguished themselves πρὸς τὸ ὀσίως βιώναι, like the next category up: 114b6-7); and possibly (c) that there is some kind of hierarchy among the inhabitants (τιμὰς φέρονται κτλ.) – which would in turn imply (d) that they form some kind of society (cf. Achilles' lament at *Od.* 11.489-91, that he would rather be a hired labourer on earth than *king* among the dead?). The last would not be surprising, since they will include, perhaps as the largest group among them (cf. 90a1-2), οἱ τὴν δημοτικὴν καὶ πολιτικὴν ἀρετὴν ἐπιτετηδευκότες (82a11-b1; for the connection with that context, see **a5n**). All require 'purification' from their excessive attachment to the body (81b1-c6; including those who have practised δ. καὶ π. ἀρετὴ, as 68d-69a shows), although evidently the process is far from completed during their stay (see 81d-82b). Those who commit serious crimes, and go to worse places than the Acherusian lake (113e6-114a6), will only be reborn, if at all, after themselves being promoted there (114a7-b6); among these, presumably, will be the ones who find themselves back as the more savage animals (82a3-5). P. himself, however, prefers not to spell these details out – either because he prefers subtle economy to prosaic completeness, or because he means each of the two passages (i.e. the present one, and that at 81-2) to work its effect in its own context without encouraging us to dwell on the elaborateness of the eschatology involved, although as a careful writer he has ensured that all the details really do fit together; again there is a certain playfulness in the whole construction (cf. 81d1-2n., and e.g. 111a6-7n.).

ei-2 οἱ δ' ἂν δόξωσιν ἀνιάτως ἔχειν: like Tantalus, Sisyphus and Tityus (*Gorg.* 525e). **e5** δέ: as at 78c8 (see n.); also at 114a3. **e7** οἶον 'as for instance'.

114a1 μεταμέλον αὐτοῖς: acc. abs. **a2-3** τοιούτῳ τινὶ ἄλλῳ τρόπῳ: i.e. under other similar extenuating circumstances, including regret for the thing done (καὶ μεταμέλον κτλ.). **a6** πατραλοίας . . . μητραλοίας 'father-beaters . . . mother-beaters'. **a7-8** κατὰ τὴν λίμνην τὴν Ἀχερουσιάδα: cf. 113b2-3, **c5**. **a9** ὕβρισαν 'assaulted'.

a9-b1 *ἵκετεύουσι καὶ δέονται*: at Athens, killers were evidently no longer liable to legal action or punishment if their victims forgave them before dying (Dem. 37.59).

b2-3 *λήγουσι τῶν κακῶν*: i.e. the extreme ones they encountered in Cocytus and Pyriphlegethon. **b6** *ὑπὸ τῶν δικαστῶν*: cf. 113d3-4 (and *Gorg.* 523e-524a, *Ap.* 41a). **b6** *οἱ δὲ δὴ ... 7 βιῶναι*: lit. 'But those who seem [to have lived] exceptionally in the direction of living virtuously'. *δὴ* marks out this *οἱ δὲ* in contrast to the others (cf. 65agn.); we here reach the climax of this section of S.'s story. *δοσίως* = 'virtuously': *δοσιότης*, more strictly 'piety', must here have a wider connotation, since it is opposed to criminal acts in general; and in P. generally it frequently stands for what we call the 'moral' virtues as a whole (as e.g. *passim* in *Euth.*). This category of people must be separate from *οἱ τὴν δημοτικὴν καὶ πολιτικὴν ἀρετὴν ἐπιτετηδευκότες* (82a11-b1), because it includes the philosophers (c2 *τούτων δὲ αὐτῶν κτλ.*), who were directly contrasted with them (68d-69a, which also described this sort of 'virtue' as bogus; cf. 113d6-e1n.). **b7-8** *οἱ τῶνδε μὲν τῶν τόπων ... c1 ὥσπερ δεσμωτηρίων*: 'these places within the earth' must refer to Acheron, etc. (this category is not condemned, as it were, to the prisons below); but the following words recall the recurring image of the body as the prison of the soul (62b3-4, with 67d1-2, 81e1, 92a1). In fact, only a sub-group of the present category, *οἱ φιλοσοφίαι ἱκανῶς καθηράμενοι*, will get clear of *this* prison altogether (c2-6); but the others too will be close to such a state (see esp. 111b3-6n.). At the same time, there is also an allusion to S.'s own present position (in the prison of the body, which is itself in a real prison), which suggests that he is predicting this second grade of happiness for himself, rather than the first (cf. 111b7n.). If, as seems likely, what awaits the fully-fledged philosopher is actually becoming divine (see following n.), it would be surprising to find S., of all people, firmly expecting that future for himself (see 61dg n., 78a4n., 89c7-8n., 97b6-7, 108c8n.). On the other hand, *Phd.* seems to show him as having the relevant qualifications.

c1-2 *ἄνω δὲ κτλ.*: see 110b-111c. **c2** *τούτων ... αὐτῶν*: i.e. of those introduced in b6-7 (*οἱ ... βιῶναι*). **c3** *φιλοσοφίαι ἱκανῶς καθηράμενοι*: if *οἱ ἐπὶ γῆς οἰκίζόμενοι* possess real virtue (see b6n.), then they must be philosophers (69a-d, which represents *ἀρετή* and

φρόνησις as two sides of a single coin: cf. 107d2, and c7 below); but, evidently, their rejection of the body was not as complete as it might have been (*total* separation from the body in life is of course impossible: 67c-d). **c3-4** *τὸ παράπαν* qualifies *ἄνευ ... σωμάτων* ('absolument sans corps', Robin), and contrasts this group with the one before, who do have bodies of a sort (111a7-c3). **c4-5** *οἰκήσεις ἔτι τούτων καλλίους*: i.e. even more beautiful than the ones referred to in c1-2. These are, presumably, the habitations of the gods: see 82b10-c1 *εἰς δὲ γε θεῶν γένος μὴ φιλοσοφήσαντι καὶ παντελῶς καθαρῶι ἀπιόντι οὐ θέμις ἀφικνεῖσθαι ἄλλ' ἢ τῶι φιλομαθεῖ*. **c5** *οὔτε ὁ χρόνος κτλ.*: cf. 108d8-9, with the passage from *Phdr.* cited in the n. **c6** *ἀλλὰ τούτων δὲ ἕνεκα χρὴ κτλ.*: for *ἀλλὰ ... χρὴ*, cf. *ἀλλὰ* + imperative at 91c6. *δὴ* is emphatic ('for the sake of *these* things': cf. 107c-d).

d1 *μὲν οὖν*: *μὲν* is answered by d2 *μέντοι*; *οὖν* is merely transitional ('now'). Cf. e.g. 62b2n. **d2** *δυσχυρίσασθαι*: cf. 100d7. **d3** *ἐστίν* 'are the case'. **d4** *περὶ τὰς ψυχὰς ἡμῶν καὶ τὰς οἰκήσεις*: despite the fact that only one small category among the dead will be completely bodiless (c2-4, with e.g. 76b-c), all can still be described as (separated) *ψυχαί*, in accordance with the original definition of death at 64c, to the extent that all certainly leave corpses behind. That the souls of the dead retain some sort of bodily shape is part of the Homeric conception (see esp. *Od.* 11) which forms the backdrop to the arguments of the *Phaedo* (70a4-5n., 64c4-5n.); the reason why most Platonic 'dead' souls do so has of course been given at 81c-e. **d4** *ἐπείπερ ... οὐσα* 'given that the soul is clearly [something] immortal': S. here reasserts his trust in the final argument (cf. 107c2 *εἴπερ ἡ ψυχὴ ἀθάνατος*). Further work needs to be done to it, but it is, he thinks, fundamentally sound: 107b4-9. (For *ἐπείπερ ... γε*, cf. 77d4 *ἐπειδὴ γε*.) The Homeric residents of Hades (see preceding n.) could not be described as *ἀθάνατοι*, even if they continued in existence for ever: the fact that they are *dead*, i.e. that they were once alive, are so no longer, and never will be again (unless through the intervention of a Heracles: see Eur. *Alc.*), is their main feature, reflected in their complete insubstantiality - which for Simmias and Cebes, at least, constitutes grounds for suggesting that they cease to exist altogether (70a1-6, 77b3-5, d5-e7). **d4** *τοῦτο ... 6 ἔχειν* 'this it seems to me both to be fitting (sc. *δυσχυρίσασθαι*) and to be worth risking (sc. *δυσχυρίσασθαι*, or *οἶεσθαι*, or both) for

[someone] who thinks it to be so'. **d6** καλὸς γὰρ ὁ κίνδυνος: cf. c8 καλὸν . . . τὸ ἄθλον. **d6–7** ὥσπερ ἐπαίδειν: cf. 77e9, 78a5. In both contexts, the reference is to ways of ridding oneself of fears about death; the difference is that in the first these were apparently to be rational arguments (paradoxically, since 'charms' or 'spells' would normally be prime examples of the irrational), whereas here the ἐπωιδαί are things that have not been rationally established. For S., they do somehow follow on from the conclusions of his arguments (107c2, 114d4); they are underpinned by his belief that this is the best of all possible worlds (cf. nn. to 108d4–5, 108e4–109a6, etc.), which no doubt he would *hope* to see established. Meanwhile, however, his reference to his μῦθος as a kind of ἐπωιδή (in the normal sense) reinforces his admission (d1–2) that it is not something on whose truth he, or any sensible person, would insist. **d7** διὸ δὴ κτλ.: 'which is why I myself have been spinning out my story for so long now' (as if the words themselves would do the trick, as in a spell). **d8** ἀλλὰ . . . δὴ: cf. 78a10n.

e3 πλέον θάτερον: lit. 'more of the other', i.e. more which is κακόν than good (an idiomatic expression: see Burnet). **e2** τοὺς κόσμους 'its adornments'.

115a2 περιμένει: cf. the original discussion of the prohibition on suicide (61d–62c). **a5–6** ἐμὲ δὲ νῦν ἤδη . . . ἢ εἰμαρμένη 'And now it's *me* that fate calls, [as] a man in a tragic play would say', which suggests that he himself is in a 'tragic' or serious plight; but on his account, of course, he is not – and so he goes on, 'and now I think it's just about time for me to make for the bath' (a6), as if nothing out of the ordinary were happening. Of course it is no ordinary bath (a7–8); at the same time what is summoning him is nothing so grand as fate, but simple questions of practical convenience. Alternatively, a6 σχεδόν τι . . . λουτρὸν continues the reference to tragedy (cf. the hero's ritual cleansing at Soph. *Ajax* 654–6); in which case the change of tone is effected by a8 alone. *Symp.* 174a tells us that S.'s baths were infrequent; now he takes one just when he is about to have no further use for his body. **a7** δὴ reinforces γὰρ, as at 76a1, etc. **a8** καὶ μὴ κτλ. 'and not give the women the trouble of washing a corpse' (λούειν is perhaps best treated as an explanatory or 'limiting' inf.: cf. *MT* 763ff.).

115b1–end: Socrates dies

The tragicomic tone of 115a5–8 gives a foretaste of the final scene, in which S.'s cheerfulness in facing death is contrasted with the grief of everyone else. The grief is for different reasons: the jailer and the women, who have not heard S.'s arguments, are upset for S., as also, at least according to S., is Crito; while the others are upset, not for him but for themselves, because they are losing the companionship of such a man. The 'charms', then (114d7), have worked their effect – up to the point where he drinks the hemlock (117c–e; for another description of the state of those present prior to that moment, see 58e–59b).

115b3 ἄλλου του is probably neut. **b3–4** ὅτι ἂν κτλ.: lit. 'by doing which we would do [what we do] most pleasingly to you'. For ἐν χάριτι, cf. e.g. ἐν βραχεῖ = βραχέως, and LSJ s.v. ἐν π. **b5** οὐδὲν καινότερον 'nothing very new'. **b6–7** καὶ ἐμοὶ καὶ τοῖς ἐμοῖς . . . ἐν χάριτι ποιήσετε 'pleasingly, to me and mine', because beneficially; because, by improving themselves (ὑμῶν αὐτῶν ἐπιμελούμενοι, i.e. caring for your real selves, your souls: cf. c4–116a1), they will to that degree be making the world a better place? But see further 116b6n. **b8** μὲν can be defended as 'solitary', suggesting '[and care for other things]': cf. 69d9–10n., and Verdenius. P. frequently prefers to avoid complete balance (ὑμῶν αὐτῶν ἐπιμελούμενοι / ὑμῶν αὐτῶν ἀμελήτε). **b10** ἐν τῷ ἐμπροσθεν χρόνῳ: once more S. emphasises the continuity of their present conversations with those they have had before (cf. 59a, 75d, 78c–d). **b10–c1** οὐδὲ ἂν πολλὰ κτλ. 'even if you agree [sc. verbally, about what I say and have always said you should do] many times over, and vehemently, you will do no good [sc. to yourselves, still less to me]'.

c2 ταῦτα μὲν τοίνυν προθυμησόμεθα . . . οὕτω ποιεῖν 'Then we'll be keen to do this as you say.' **c3** θάπτωμεν δέ σε τίνα τρόπον; Cf. 116a1. S. goes on (c4ff.) to pretend, jokingly, that this question shows that his arguments have not persuaded Crito (though there will turn out also to be a serious point: see e5–6n.). If S. really thought this, it is not clear that he would have regarded it as a laughing matter; and in fact Crito's question is a perfectly natural one, whether he is convinced or not. He is simply taking charge of practical matters (cf. 116a3, b3–4, d7–9, 118a7–8), as he has always done (59b7n.), and

as S. knows (since he gives any subsequent directions to him). **c5** γελάσας ... **δ** εἶπεν 'With a quiet laugh and a glance at us, he said.' **c7-8** διατάττων ἑκαστον τῶν λεγομένων 'setting out in order [the various parts of] each of the things said' (i.e. his arguments).

d1 δὴ introduces the ironic repetition of Crito's question. **d4** εἰς μακάρων δὴ τινὰς εὐδαιμονίας 'to certain states of happiness which belong to the blest'. For δὴ τινὰς, cf. 107d7-8n.; the studied vagueness of the expression – which also recalls, but significantly varies, Hes. *WD* 171 ἐν μακάρων νήσοισι – is consistent with what he said about his μῦθος at 114d (but cf. also 114b7-c1n.). **d4** ταῦτα ... **ε** λέγειν 'I think I'm putting this to him in vain' (παρὰ μὲν οὕτως κτλ.: so Crito has a sharper critical eye than all the rest of them?). **d7-8** ἦν οὗτος κτλ.: we have no information about such an event from outside *Phd.*; the best suggestion seems to be that Crito offered his guarantee (unsuccessfully – ἡγγυᾶτο, 'conative' impf.) if S. were to be spared waiting for his execution in prison (see Hackforth).

e5-6 τὸ μὴ καλῶς λέγειν κτλ.: i.e. if we speak imprecisely, that will cause us to think imprecisely too. (εἰς αὐτὸ τοῦτο means 'in regard to this very thing', i.e. in itself.)

116a1 νόμιμον 'customary', 'usual'. **a2** ἀνίστατο 'got up and went'. This and the following imperfects describe the actions involved as taking time (and as they would have appeared to an onlooker) rather than as simple events (cf. 59e8-60a1 ἐκέλευεν ... εἰσιόντες ... κατελαμβάνομεν). **a5** ἀνασκοποῦντες 'reviewing', 'going back over'. **τοτέ** δ' αὖ 'and sometimes' ('as if **τοτέ** μὲν had preceded', Burnet). **a6** διεξιόντες 'going over'.

b3 ἐκεῖναι: i.e. Xanthippe (60a) and others. **b3** ἐναντίον τοῦ Κρίτωνος ... **4** ἐβούλετο: at least the main part of the conversation (διαλεχθεῖς) seems to have been practical (ἐπιστεῖλας), with Crito there as executor, and guardian of the children. **b6** χρόνον γὰρ πολὺν κτλ. suggests detailed discussion of practical arrangements for his family; contrast 115b5-8. **b7** λελουμένος: since we know why he went off for a bath, his sitting down 'freshly bathed' already indicates what is to come (b8 καὶ ἦκεν κτλ.). **b7** καὶ οὐ πολλὰ ... **8** καὶ ἦκεν ὁ τῶν ἑνδεκα ὑπηρέτης 'and he had said just a few things to us, when the agent of

the Eleven came' (see *GP* 293). **b8-ci** στάς παρ' αὐτόν 'coming up to him'.

ci γέ emphasizes the following σοῦ. **c4** καὶ ἄλλως ... **6-7** καὶ δὴ καὶ νῦν: cf. 112e8-113a1. **c5** ἐν τούτῳ τῷ χρόνῳ: i.e. during your time in prison. **c7-8** οὐκ ἐμοὶ κτλ. 'you are not angry with me, since you recognise those responsible, but with them.'

d2 καὶ ἄμα κτλ. 'Bursting into tears as he said this, he turned and went away.' **d4** ἡμεῖς ταῦτα ποιήσομεν: to anyone who has been listening to τὰ εἰρημένα (116a5), but not to the official, 'we [i.e. I] shall do this' will mean primarily χαίρησομεν – what is about to happen will, he thinks, bring him happiness. **d5-6** καὶ παρὰ πάντα ... τὸν χρόνον ... **7** καὶ νῦν 'both throughout (παρὰ) the whole time ... , and now ...'. **d7** ὥς is exclamatory. **d7-8** ἀλλ' ἄγε δὴ ... πειθώμεθα αὐτῷ 'Come, then, let us do as he says.' 'Clearly a Homeric reminiscence', *GP* 14 (ἀλλ' ἄγε δὴ + 'hortative' subj., or imper., is common in Homer, which it is not in P.; the rhythm, too, is that of a hexameter). Cf. 115a5 (Hom., for P., is himself one of the tragic poets: see *Rep.* 595b-c).

e3 οἶδα ... **4** αὐτοῖς 'I know that others too drink [the hemlock] very late, when the order is given to them', i.e. that they delay doing so until long after the order is given. **e4-5** καὶ συγγενομένους γ' ἐνίου κτλ. 'and what's more (καὶ ... γε) having had intercourse with those they happened to feel desire for': not that S. would want to do any of these things, nor is Crito suggesting it; his point is just about the time still available – or that, plus the contrast between what others want and what S. does. **e6** ἔτι ... ἐγχωρεῖ 'there is still time'. **e7** εἰκότως γε ... **117a2** παρ' ἑμαυτῷ 'It is with good reason (emphatic γε) both (τε) that those people that you refer to do this, for they think that they will gain by doing it; and I will not do this, with good reason, for I do not think that I gain anything at all by drinking a little later – anything else, that is (γε²), apart from making myself look ridiculous in my own eyes.' The introduction of οἶονται γὰρ ... ποιήσαντες slightly disturbs the syntax.

117a2-3 φειδόμενος οὐδενὸς ἔτι ἐνόητος 'being sparing when there is nothing more left in [the jar]': for the idea, evidently proverbial, cf. Hes. *WD* 368-9.